Electronically Filed 10/24/2024 2:12 PM Fourth Judicial District, Ada County Trent Tripple, Clerk of the Court By: Jennifer Keyes, Deputy Clerk

Anne Taylor Law, PLLC Anne C. Taylor, Attorney at Law PO Box 2347 Coeur d'Alene, Idaho 83816

Phone: (208) 512-9611

iCourt Email: info@annetaylorlaw.com

Jay W. Logsdon, First District Public Defender Idaho State Public Defender 1450 Northwest Blvd. Coeur d'Alene, Idaho 83814 Phone: (208) 605-4575

Elisa G. Massoth, PLLC Attorney at Law P.O. Box 1003 Payette, Idaho 83661

Phone: (208) 642-3797; Fax: (208)642-3799

Assigned Attorney:

Anne C. Taylor, Attorney at Law, Bar Number: 5836

Jay W. Logsdon, First District Public Defender, Bar Number: 8759

Elisa G. Massoth, Attorney at Law, Bar Number: 5647

IN THE DISTRICT COURT OF THE FOURTH JUDICIAL DISTRICT OF THE STATE OF IDAHO, IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF ADA

STATE OF IDAHO

Plaintiff,

V.

BRYAN C. KOHBERGER,

Defendant.

CASE NUMBER CR01-24-31665

REPLY TO STATE'S OBJECTION TO DEFENDANT'S MOTION TO STRIKE STATE'S NOTICE OF INTENT TO SEEK DEATH PENALTY ON GROUNDS OF CONTEMPORARY STANDARDS OF DECENCY

COMES NOW, Bryan C. Kohberger, by and through his attorneys of record, hereby submits the following Reply to the State's Objection to his Motion to Strike the State's Notice of Intent to Seek the Death Penalty on the Grounds of Contemporary Standards of Decency.

REPLY TO STATE'S OBJECTION TO DEFENDANT'S MOTION TO STRIKE STATE'S NOTICE OF INTENT TO SEEK DEATH PENALTY ON GROUNDS OF CONTEMPORARY STANDARDS OF DECENCY

The State argues that the Idaho Supreme Court previously determined that contemporary standards of decency do not preclude the death penalty in *State v. Abdullah*, 158 Idaho 386, 455 (2015). The Court in *Abdullah* ruled against his challenge, finding that to launch such a challenge, a defendant needs to show changes in legislation or executive action to go along with changes in public opinion. *Id.* At that time, the Court found that "[t]hirty-two states, the military, and the federal government continue to allow the death penalty as an option." *Id.* (*citing* DEATH PENALTY INFORMATION CENTER, http://www.deathpenaltyinfo.org/states-and-without-death-penalty (last visited February 23, 2015); Tracy L. Snell, Bureau of Justice Statistics, U.S. Dep't of Justice, *Capital Punishment*, 2012–Statistical Tables (Rev.2014), available at http://www.bjs.gov/content/pub/pdf/cp12st.pdf.).

That may have been true, but times have changed. Now, twenty-four states have an operating death penalty. **DEATH** PENALTY **INFORMATION** CENTER, https://deathpenaltyinfo.org/state-and-federal-info/state-by-state (last visited October 19, 2024). The federal government has declared a hold on executions. Id. Ohio's governor has paused executions until a new method is adopted. Id. And Arizona has paused them until they can trust their courts to do the right thing. Id. Therefore, in reality, less than half the states still have the death penalty pursuant to legislative or executive actions. Taking population of those states into account, support for the death penalty is even bleaker. Of those that retain it, Idaho, Indiana, Kansas, Kentucky, Louisiana, Montana, Nevada, North Carolina, and Wyoming, have not executed anyone in at least ten years. DEATH PENALTY INFORMATION CENTER, https://deathpenaltyinfo.org/executions/executions-overview/executions-by-state-and-year (last visited October 19, 2024). That leaves thirteen jurisdictions with active death rows.

Thus, the evolving standards of society, and the unusualness of the death penalty, have

changed. This Court should take these changes into account and strike the penalty in this matter.

DATED this 24 day of October, 2024.

BY:

JAY W. LOGSDON

FIRST DISTRICT PUBLIC DEFENDER

lay Topsdon

CERTIFICATE OF DELIVERY

I hereby certify that a true and correct copy of the foregoing was personally served by placing a copy of the same as indicated below on the ____24____ day of October, 2024, addressed to:

Latah County Prosecuting Attorney –via Email: paservice@latahcountyid.gov

Elisa Massoth – via Email: <u>legalassistant@kmrs.net</u>
Jay Logsdon – via Email: <u>Jay.Logsdon@spd.idaho.gov</u>
Ingrid Batey – via Email: <u>ingrid.batey@ag.idaho.gov</u>

Jeff Nye – via Email: jeff.nye@ag.idaho.gov